Gary Forsyth, *Primary Sources for Ancient History*. 2 vols. Pittsburgh: 2018. Volume 1: 978-1-4809-5144-0, 418 pages. Volume 2: 978-1-4809-5425-0, 506 pages, no maps or illustrations.

F. Dolansky and S. Raucci, eds. *Rome. A Source Book of the Ancient City*. Bloomsbury: 2018). 9781441194190, 272 pages, 11 illustrations, 4 maps.

The mission which I have chosen to accept is to write a review of two considerably different sourcebooks. Assessing the value of a sourcebook is a highly subjective task that is contingent upon one's own teaching style and pedagogical goals. In this review, I aim not at the impossible mission of recommending one of these two sourcebooks for a hypothetical course, but to consider the two in light of each other by assessing the strengths and weaknesses of each as pedagogical aids. If I draw any conclusions on the nature of sourcebook composition, I intend not to be a voice of authority, but to provide the reader with insight into my selective process to allow them to better judge the value of this review for their own purposes.

Gary Forsythe's *Primary Sources for Ancient History* comprises two volumes, covering around three thousand years of Mediterranean and Near Eastern history from Sumer to Attila in English translation in close to 900 pages. The preface to each volume begins with the same paragraph, laying out the author's aim to produce a pair of primary source volumes to accompany narrative history textbooks in the teaching of two consecutive semester-long introductory surveys of the ancient Mediterranean and Near East. Each volume ends with a bibliography of additional secondary sources organised according to the sections of the main text.

The first volume (Volume I: The Ancient Near East and Greece) contains 39 readings divided among five parts: Early Mesopotamia and Egypt (58pp), The Late Bronze Age (43pp), The Great Empires and the Hebrews (57pp), The Greek Archaic Period (76pp), and The Classical Period of Greece (146pp).[1] The Late Bronze Age material is focused on the Egyptians and the Hittites, including a section on Hittite texts about Ahhiyawa/Achaea. The Great Empires and the Hebrews contains the only treatment of the various Assyrian empires and the Achaemenid Persians appear only in relation to their various enemies and subjects: Babylonian, Hebrew and Greek. The archaic section includes readings on Homeric society (from Samuel Butler's 1898 prose translation of Homer); colonization, tyranny, and Sparta (from Herodotus, Thucydides, Xenophon and Aristotle); and a small sampling of lyric poetry. The Classical Greek readings are a well-balanced mix of the major historical literary sources (including the Old Oligarch, Xenophon's *Hellenica*, Plutarch and Diodorus Siculus) as well as a small selection of epigraphic material related to Athenian

---

[1] The numbers of pages in each section are given as a general indication of the space devoted to each topic.

government. This part ends with Alexander's death and no sources are included from the Hellenistic Period.

The second volume (Volume II: The Roman World) divides its 35 readings into five parts: From Tibur to Mediterranean Empire (131pp), The Late Republic (118pp), The Principate (101pp), Religion in the Roman Empire and the Rise of Christianity (56pp), and The Later Roman Empire (64pp). The focus of the opening section is Rome's territorial expansion with some treatment of internal political developments; passages from Plutarch and Polybius provide variation from the author's own translations of Livy. The section on the late republic focuses on the highlights of internal politics: Appian and Plutarch on the Gracchi; Plutarch on Marius, Sulla, Crassus and Spartacus, and Pompey (including his conquests in the East); Sallust on Catiline; a selection of Cicero's political letters; and a selection of short passages on Caesar (including from Cassius Dio and Suetonius, but none from Caesar himself). The section on the Principate begins with the Julio-Claudians (sections from the *Res Gestae*, Tacitus on Augustus and on Nero, and Seneca's *Apocolocyntosis*) then moves to epigraphic social history, military inscriptions, and Juvenal *Satire* 3. The inclusion of a section on religion is commendable and of mixed quality: the calendar of Magna Mater's festival days is an excellent inclusion, but Prudentius' lurid depiction of the Taurobolium and Plutarch's description of Mithridatic pirates worshiping Mithras are both problematic and require significantly more introduction and discussion than are provided. Coverage of the Late Roman Empire is scant and focused on continuing the story of Christianity from the previous part. The five readings are Diocletian's price edict; Lactantius on Diocletian and Constantine (*On the Deaths of the Persecutors* 7–23 and 44); selections from the Theodosian code comprising laws against paganism; Ammianus Marcellinus on Valens' persecution of various pagans (29.1–2); and a fragment of Priscus on Attila (Muller, *FGH* fr 8).

The preface to each volume ends with a statement on Forsythe's compositional methodology:

> In an attempt to make these volumes as affordable as possible, the translations, whenever feasible, have been excerpted from works no longer under copyright and thus requiring permission from and payment to publishers for reproducing copyrighted material.

Most of selections come from translations of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries with little updating for modern language use. That said, the translations are well-selected for readability, despite the odd archaism (examples include "hereupon" and "heretofore" (I.200), "straightway", "rapine" (II.429) and "potations" (II.485), and a few thees and thous in quoted direct speech). At the publisher's price of US$25

(Volume I, ~400 pages) and US$28 (Volume II, ~500 pages) for each of the two volumes, Forsythe has achieved his goal here.[2]

In terms of content, Forsythe's sourcebook hits his target well. Instructors teaching introductory surveys of the ancient world who want a course text focusing on traditional literary sources for political history of the Near East, Archaic and Classical Greece, and the Late Republic and Early Empire should be satisfied with either or both of these volumes. Those whose courses include the Hellenistic Kingdoms beyond the Italian peninsula, or significant coverage of the Roman Empire from the second century CE, or who want to include evidence from documentary or non-elite sources will need to provide appropriate supplemental material.

Dolansky and Raucci's *Rome: A Source Book of the Ancient City* divides its sources into 11 thematic chapters, further divided into subsections each including multiple quotations, covering the city of Rome as a lived environment. Each subsection contains a variable number (usually 4–8) of paragraph-length quotations drawn from a wide range of classical authors, from the poetic (Vergil, Ovid) to the political (Augustus, Cicero) to the historical (Livy, Suetonius, Plutarch) to the technical (Vitruvius, Strabo, Galen) to the antiquarian (Aulus Gellius, Varro). The chapters are preceded by maps of Rome under Augustus, Trajan and Constantine and a Chronology of Rome's Rulers including the Kings and the Emperors from Augustus to Constantine.

Following an introduction emphasizing the palimpsetic nature of Rome, Chapter 1, "Introducing the City of Rome", aims to show the many ways that ancient writers conceptualised the city as a geographic, imperial, mythic and personal center. Chapter 2, "The Lived-in City" attempts to give a sense of the material conditions of life in ancient Rome from noise, crowds, transport, fire, food and the range of urban dwellings from *insulae* to *domus aurea*. Chapter 3, "The City at Work and Play" covers *otium* and *negotium*: commerce, markets, labor, sex, baths, holidays, libraries and art. Chapter 4, "The City by Day and Night", presents Rome as the city that never slept. Chapter 5, "Spectacle in the City", addresses the place of the circus, the theatre and the amphitheatre in the economic, political, historical, and social fabric of Rome. Chapter 6, "Religion in the City", examines the religious landscape of temples and festivals as well as significant sections on Augustus' influence on that religious landscape and on the religious diversity of the city from the Magna Mater to the Christians. Chapter 7, "The Political City" presents the monumentalization of government institutions and personal glory, from republican spaces to imperial palaces. Chapter 8, "Urban Infrastructure", focuses on aqueducts, sewers, streets and walls. Chapter 9, "Victory and the City" begins with several readings about the triumph before moving to readings about arches and victory monuments. Chapter 10,

---

[2] By comparison, the publisher's price for the softcover of Dolanksy and Raucci's 250 page sourcebook is still reasonable at GB£26.

"The City Under Siege", addresses disasters (fire, flood, famine and disease) and the various official and unofficial responses. Chapter 11, "Death and the City" closes the volume with readings about funerals, tombs, disposing of the dead, and executions. A handful of black and white photos are interspersed throughout the text to illustrate certain aspects (for example, the remains of the Baths of Caracalla, p.60; a photo of Gismondi's cut-away model of the Forum of Augustus, p.129; the interior of the Pantheon, p.153). Throughout all eleven chapters, the selected readings address the topic of the sub-section from a variety of angles, ranging from construction, to daily use and experience, to literary imagination. The resulting juxtaposition illuminates Rome as a rich and vibrant centerpiece to a multifaceted empire.

How much support should the editor of a sourcebook give to a reader? These two examples are a contrast in styles both in terms of the degree of support and how it is formatted. Forsythe opts to provide editorial comment on the selected texts with bracketed comments in the text rather than in footnotes with the result that those comments tend to blend deceptively into the ancient text. In addition, several of the Near Eastern texts also use parenthetical words and phrases to translate Near Eastern grammatical structures to English and several texts single out metaphorical word uses and proper noun phrases in quotation marks but neither practice is noted in the introduction. Kramer's translation of "The Curse of Agade" from the third edition of Pritchard's *Ancient Near Eastern Texts Relating to the Old Testament* (1969), pp.647–651, here reprinted as "The End of the Sargonid Dynasty" (I.29–35), is a good example of both. Kramer preserves the line structure of the tablet and includes ample footnotes expanding on curious turns of phrase ("had killed (the people of) Kish like the "Bull of Heaven", Pritchard p.647 n.16), the ambiguity and semantic range of certain words (e.g. "heads", Pritchard p. 647 n.17), and various proper nouns ("Marhashi", Pritchard p.647 n.18. Except for removing the line breaks, Forsythe's text retains the translation and orthography, but provides no editorial comments or footnotes on a text that will no doubt be unfamiliar to the intended audience, and provides no explanation of the various untranslated words from the original translation (e.g "abzaza", Forsythe I.30). An instructor using this text will need to carefully select the accompanying narrative textbook or provide a lot of additional support in what is probably not their specialty area. Much of Dolanksy and Raucci's editorial comment comes in the form of introductory paragraphs. Each chapter begins with an overview of its subsections and general introduction to its theme and each subsection begins with an introduction to the topic often including a very general introduction to the quoted ancient author. Editorial clarifications to the texts themselves are given in parentheses and brackets (again, the orthography is not explained) and longer comments are included in endnotes, collected at the end of the book. Dolanksy and Raucci's introductory paragraphs provide broad context for the source quotations and integrate those quotations into the overall thematic structure of the work. There is much to discuss and examine about each collection, but little preparatory scaffolding is required before assigning these chapters as readings.

Because an introductory text often serves as the student's first encounter with ancient sources, the typical reader is less attuned to the orthographic signals that separate primary text from editorial comment and often mistake editorial remarks and clarifications for the ancient evidence itself. The layout of Dolanksy and Raucci's sourcebook is clear and consistent throughout: primary quotations separated from the surrounding text by lines above and below and headed by the standard reference notation. Forsythe's volumes have a simple layout that could have benefited from a little more complexity in this regard. Most of the source texts are not visually distinguished from the editor's introductory remarks—both have the same font, font-size, and form of indentation. There are several exceptions in the Greek Archaic and Classical sections where the ancient text is indented with prominent reference notation and is clearly distinguished from the editorial comments. It is unclear why that layout was not used throughout. This basic problem of reading a new style of text cannot be entirely eliminated, but given the usual audience of a sourcebook, efforts to ease the process for newcomers by changing fonts, font-size or italicisation are beneficial to both reader and instructor. Opportunities for "teachable moments" will always arise, but a sourcebook can do much to minimise basic misunderstandings.

Although a relatively small proportion of students in an introductory survey will go on to further study in the field, it is my overwhelming preference that textbooks and sourcebooks serve as a model for new scholars intending to continue and prepares them from more advanced research by demonstrating correct use of scholarly citation methods. In this regard, Dolanksy and Raucci are exemplary. Most section introductions are often followed by a short list of secondary scholarship for additional reading and each reading itself is headed by the standard reference for the citation in the form you would see in any scholarly monograph. While Forsythe's collection provides all the citations necessary to engage in further research, the method of displaying it puts unnecessary barriers in the path of the interested student. Few readings include information that would make it easy for a student to find the included passage in a full translation of the source. For texts from major historians, Forsythe refers to the work and the book number in his citation of the translation, but only includes the chapter or section numbers in the body of the passage. The full primary source citation is seldom given. Other sources are more problematic. He provides his own numbering system for the Greek lyric poets in Volume I but does not cite any standard notation, merely giving page numbers to the translation he uses. In Volume II, readings 23 C and 23 D present 57 graffiti and 17 epitaphs respectively, none of which are individually numbered or cited.[3] Inscriptions are some of the most interesting ancient evidence to bring into the classroom and the inclusion of translated inscriptions in sourcebooks like this is one of the most valuable services

---

[3] The graffiti are translated into English from Diehl's *Pompeianische Wandinschriften* (1910) and the epitaphs derive from Lewis and Reinhold's *Roman Civilization* (1955). Both sections are cited as such, but any individual citations to relevant *CIL* numbers are absent.

a sourcebook can provide to an instructor. That value is increased if they can be easily referenced in the classroom or in student papers and if they can reinforce teaching about the value of citation and notation in scholarship.

As Forsythe notes, no selection can please all instructors (I.ix). Forsythe provides a traditional selection that serve many instructors of ancient world surveys well. The virtue of Forsythe's text is in compiling freely accessible texts into a handy volume suitable for daily classroom use at relatively low cost to students, but it does little to aid student understanding of the texts or to help the student seeking additional material from the same source.[4] A further caveat on the low price is that because most of the included sources are out of copyright, most of the content is freely available online and because the sourcebook does little to improve or supplement that material, it adds little to its value as a compilation of those earlier translations. Nevertheless, as anyone who uses free online translations knows, compiling these texts is not "free" in terms of the instructor's time and energy. Instructors seeking a compilation of lengthy quotations from important primary sources in a conveniently arranged pair of volumes and who prefer to provide much of their own context and support to their students should find Forsythe's volumes to their taste. Dolanksy and Raucci's collection gives a broad overview of the different thematic approaches to Rome suitable for a course focusing on the ancient city. Their text sacrifices depth on any single source, but provides a greater degree of scaffolding to the reader, as well as ample tools for the interested student to pursue additional context and content.

HAMISH CAMERON
BATES COLLEGE
hcameron@bates.edu

---

[4] The headers in Forsythe Volume I contain the author's name and the full volume title, so are of little help in navigation of the text. In Volume 2, the same information is included in the footer, with the headers blank. Dolansky and Raucci's headers give the chapter title.